

Logged in as: *brutzman* ( Don Brutzman - developer )

2017-05-10 08:34 PDT

Project: 
[Main](#) | [My View](#) | [View Issues](#) | [Report Issue](#) | [Change Log](#) | [Roadmap](#) | [My Account](#) | [Logout](#)
Recently Visited: [0001091](#), [0000705](#), [0001071](#)**View Issue Details** [ [Jump to Notes](#) ] [ [Send a reminder](#) ]

[ &lt;&lt; ] [ &gt;&gt; ]

[ [Issue History](#) ] [ [Print](#) ]

| ID                 | Project   | Category          | View Status | Date Submitted         | Last Update      |
|--------------------|-----------|-------------------|-------------|------------------------|------------------|
| 0000488            | X3D       | 19776-1 (XML)     | public      | 2011-10-04 09:04       | 2017-04-26 07:28 |
| <b>Reporter</b>    | daly      |                   |             |                        |                  |
| <b>Assigned To</b> | daly      |                   |             |                        |                  |
| <b>Priority</b>    | normal    | <b>Severity</b>   | minor       | <b>Reproducibility</b> | always           |
| <b>Status</b>      | confirmed | <b>Resolution</b> | reopened    |                        |                  |

**Summary** 0000488: 5.15 SFString and MFString - Handling of Quotation Marks

**Description**

Specification: X3D XML Encoding (ISO/IEC 19776-1)  
 Section: 5.15 SFString and MFString  
 URL: <http://www.web3d.org/x3d/specifications/ISO-IEC-19776-1.2-X3DEncodings-XML/Part01/EncodingOfFields.html#SFString>

Comment:

1. Double quotes inside MFString values (and only inside MFString, not SFString) should be escaped with backslashes. Common sense, and experience with various X3D browsers confirms it. However, the specification doesn't say it anywhere. It is only suggested by the example with quoting "Immel did it!", where one can see backslashes before ".

Suggestion is to add a note about it around the "Immel did it" example:

Assign To:

Change Status To:

**View Issue Details** [ [Jump to Notes](#) ] [ [Send a reminder](#) ]

[ << ] [ >> ]

[ [Issue History](#) ] [ [Print](#) ]

\*\*\*\*

Double quotes (") inside strings in MFString fields should be preceded by a backslash. Moreover, normal backslashes should be doubled. This is necessary to distinguish between double quotes delimiting items of the MFString, and double quotes inside string content.

EXAMPLE 2 Two instances of the double quote are contained in the following MFString field string:

```
<Text string=""He said, \"Immel did it!\""" />
```

The above rule does not apply to SFString, or other attributes (for example META content). That is, inside SFString and such content, backslashes don't have any special meaning.

\*\*\*\*

2. Also, note that the example 2 "Immel did it" is incorrectly marked in the spec as "EXAMPLE 2 Two instances of the double quote are contained in the following SFString field string". In fact, this is MFString, not SFString.

(See the thread "Should MFString (and SFString) in XML encoding use backslashes?" on x3d-public mailing list, [http://web3d.org/pipermail/x3d-public\\_web3d.org/2011-July/001697.html](http://web3d.org/pipermail/x3d-public_web3d.org/2011-July/001697.html) ).

#### Additional Information

Submitted by: Michalis Kamburelis, Email: [michalis.kambi@gmail.com](mailto:michalis.kambi@gmail.com)

#### Tags

No tags attached.

#### Attach Tags

(Separate by ",")  Existing tags

#### Attached Files

#### Relationships

**New relationship** Current issue

related to [0000381](#) [closed](#) [daly](#) 5.11 SFString and MFString - Syntax Corrections [[Delete](#)]

related to [0000376](#) [closed](#) [daly](#) 5.11: Change to Example [[Delete](#)]

related to [0001091](#) [acknowledged](#) [brutzman](#) 5.15 SFString and MFString - Confusion between XML and X3D syntax for SFString [[Delete](#)]

related to [0000705](#) [acknowledged](#) [brutzman](#) 5.15 SFString and MFString - Escaping backslashes [[Delete](#)]

### Upload File

#### Select File

Maximum size: 5,000  
KB

No file selected.

### Users monitoring this issue

#### User List

[daly](#) [[Delete](#)]

Username

### Notes

~0000939

[daly](#) (manager)

2011-10-05 09:14

Errata to spec - no amendment text for this section.

Provide examples for MFString and SFString that shows the use of double-quoted strings and the use of back-slash.

Accept.

~0000940

[brutzman](#) (developer)

2011-10-05 09:16

Last edited: 2011-12-07 17:41

[View 8 revisions](#)

Good points.

1. This is primarily a comment against the abstract specification, we need to ensure that it is unambiguous. Otherwise the ClassicVRML and XML encodings don't have a clear starting point.

2. We need to include another example that shows backslash escaping.

3. However, how do we handle a solitary backslash? It is an escape character. If the following character is treated as a literal, then the solitary backslash literally disappears.

Proposed prose for spec:

=====

A solitary quotation-mark character (by itself or surrounded by whitespace) is handled as if it is part of a literal string value.

EXAMPLE: `<Text string=' "' />` produces a single-element MFString, which holds a single

3-character SFString, which itself consists of two space characters and a quotation mark.

=====

[~0000977](#)

**daly** (manager)

2011-10-06 20:36

[Edit](#) [Delete](#) [Make Private](#)

Resolved for 19775-1 for abstract definition. Moved to 19776-1 for further consideration.

[~0000984](#)

**daly** (manager)

2011-12-07 08:33

[Edit](#) [Delete](#) [Make Private](#)

Need to write some replacement text for examples of handling of quotation marks and escape characters.

[~0001011](#)

**daly** (manager)

2011-12-07 17:42

Last edited: 2011-12-07 17:43

[View 2 revisions](#)

[Edit](#) [Delete](#) [Make Private](#)

Use Don's text from note [0000940](#).

[~0001026](#)

**daly** (manager)

2011-12-12 09:04

[Edit](#) [Delete](#) [Make Private](#)

Merged all 3 related issues into one comment in the document replacing all existing text with that listed in issue [0000376](#).

[~0001376](#)

**walroy** (developer)

2015-07-04 11:03

[Edit](#) [Delete](#) [Make Private](#)

Reopened and status changed because a fix for the second comment was not implemented.

 **Add Note**

[Add Note](#)

### [-] Add Note

#### Note

#### View Status

 private

#### Upload File

Maximum size: 5,000 KB

No file selected.

### [-] Issue History

| Date Modified    | Username | Field                 | Change                              |
|------------------|----------|-----------------------|-------------------------------------|
| 2011-10-04 09:04 | daly     | New Issue             |                                     |
| 2011-10-05 09:08 | daly     | Category              | 19775-1 (Abstract) => 19776-1 (XML) |
| 2011-10-05 09:08 | daly     | Description Updated   |                                     |
| 2011-10-05 09:10 | daly     | Category              | 19776-1 (XML) => 19775-1 (Abstract) |
| 2011-10-05 09:14 | daly     | Note Added: 0000939   |                                     |
| 2011-10-05 09:16 | brutzman | Note Added: 0000940   |                                     |
| 2011-10-05 09:17 | daly     | Status                | new => assigned                     |
| 2011-10-05 09:17 | daly     | Assigned To           | => daly                             |
| 2011-10-06 20:35 | daly     | Issue Monitored: daly |                                     |
| 2011-10-06 20:36 | daly     | Note Added: 0000977   |                                     |
| 2011-10-06 20:37 | daly     | Category              | 19775-1 (Abstract) => 19776-1 (XML) |
| 2011-10-06 20:37 | daly     | Assigned To           | daly =>                             |
| 2011-10-06 20:37 | daly     | Status                | assigned => new                     |
| 2011-12-07 08:32 | daly     | Status                | new => assigned                     |
| 2011-12-07 08:32 | daly     | Assigned To           | => daly                             |

## Issue History

| Date Modified    | Username                 | Field                | Change                         |
|------------------|--------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|
| 2011-12-07 08:33 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Note Added: 0000984  |                                |
| 2011-12-07 08:56 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Relationship added   | related to 0000376             |
| 2011-12-07 17:37 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:37 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:38 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:39 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:40 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:40 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:41 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0000940 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-07 17:42 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Note Added: 0001011  |                                |
| 2011-12-07 17:43 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Note Edited: 0001011 | <a href="#">View Revisions</a> |
| 2011-12-12 09:01 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Relationship added   | related to 0000381             |
| 2011-12-12 09:04 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Note Added: 0001026  |                                |
| 2011-12-12 09:04 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Status               | assigned => resolved           |
| 2011-12-12 09:04 | <a href="#">daly</a>     | Resolution           | open => fixed                  |
| 2014-04-16 07:56 | <a href="#">leodaly</a>  | Status               | resolved => closed             |
| 2015-07-04 11:01 | <a href="#">walroy</a>   | Status               | closed => confirmed            |
| 2015-07-04 11:03 | <a href="#">walroy</a>   | Note Added: 0001376  |                                |
| 2015-07-04 11:03 | <a href="#">walroy</a>   | Resolution           | fixed => reopened              |
| 2016-12-08 02:51 | <a href="#">walroy</a>   | Relationship added   | related to 0001091             |
| 2017-04-26 07:28 | <a href="#">brutzman</a> | Relationship added   | related to 0000705             |

Powered by [MantisBT](#)

Copyright © 2000 - 2017 MantisBT Team

Contact [administrator](#) for assistance



