Logged in as: *brutzman* (Don Brutzman - developer)   2017-05-10 08:15 PDT   Project: X3D

| Main | My View | View Issues | Report Issue | Change Log | Roadmap | My Account | Logout |

Issue # [Jump]

Recently Visited: 0001091, 0001071

View Issue Details [Jump to Notes] [Send a reminder]   [<<] [>>]   [Issue History] [Print]

ID	Project	Category	View Status	Date Submitted	Last Update
0000705	X3D	19776-1 (XML)	public	2015-06-30 07:22	2017-04-26 07:28

Reporter	walroy
Assigned To	brutzman

Priority	normal	**Severity**	minor	**Reproducibility**	N/A
Status	acknowledged	**Resolution**	open		

Summary   0000705: 5.15 SFString and MFString - Escaping backslashes

Description   5.15 SFString and MFString
http://www.web3d.org/files/specifications/19776-1/V3.3/Part01/EncodingOfFields.html#SFString

The X3D XML encoding specification doesn't make it clear that in XML encoding inside MFString (but *not* inside SFString) escaping backslashes is mandatory. Just like in classic encoding (where it's for both MFString and SFString).

Section "5.15 SFString and MFString" of XML encoding specification doesn't say anything about backslashes. It only shows an example:

EXAMPLE 2 Two instances of the double quote are contained in the following SFString field string:

[Edit] [Assign To:] [Reporter] [Change Status To:] confirmed [Monitor] [Clone] [Close] [Move] [Delete]

View Issue Details [Jump to Notes] [Send a reminder]   [<<] [>>]   [Issue History] [Print]

       `<Text string='"He said, \"Immel did it!\""' />`

but

1. The example description is wrong, it should apply to MFString *only*, not
to SFString. In XML encoding, backslashes should *not* be escaped for
SFString, but they *have to* be escaped for MFString.

2. The specification prose doesn't say anything about backslashes. Contrary
to a nice X3D classic encoding specification, that clearly describes the
backslashes situation.

This was discussed on x3d-public in 2011, see
http://www.web3d.org/pipermail/x3d-public_web3d.org/2011-July/001697.html ,
confirmed with other browsers, and submitted as spec comment. Without any
response or action on the part of Web3d consortium. Sorry for being harsh,
but people *are* affected by the unclear specification (see e.g.
https://sourceforge.net/p/castle-engine/tickets/14/). It's sad to see that
an issue that was reported 2 years ago is still not fixed in the spec.

I propose to fix this, by adding to spec text clarifying backslashes
situation, and also fixing "Example 2" description. Like this:

* * * * * * * * *
Double quotes (") inside strings in MFString fields should be preceded by a
backslash. Moreover, normal backslashes should be doubled. This is necessary
to distinguish between double quotes delimiting items of the MFString, and
double quotes inside string content.

EXAMPLE 2 Two instances of the double quote are contained in the following
MFString field string:
`<Text string='"He said, \"Immel did it!\""' />`

The above rule does not apply to SFString, or other attributes (for example
META content). That is, inside SFString and such content, backslashes don't
have any special meaning.

Edit | Assign To: | [Reporter] | Change Status To: | confirmed | Monitor | Clone | Close | Move | Delete

View Issue Details [Jump to Notes] [Send a reminder]   [<<] [>>]   [Issue History] [Print]

* * * * * * * * *

Additional Information	Submitted on Wednesday, June 5, 2013 - 15:54 by (Michalis Kamburelis <michalis.kambi at gmail.com>) IP: 83.5.246.47 See: http://www.web3d.org/realtime-3d/node/174/submission/153

Tags   No tags attached.

Attach Tags   (Separate by ",") [_____]   [Existing tags]   [Attach]

Attached Files

[Edit]   [Assign To:] [[Reporter]]   [Change Status To:] [confirmed]   [Monitor]   [Clone]   [Close]   [Move]   [Delete]

◻ **Relationships**

New relationship   Current issue [related to]   [_____]   [Add]

related to   0000488 confirmed   daly   5.15 SFString and MFString - Handling of Quotation Marks [Delete]

related to   0001091 acknowledged   brutzman   5.15 SFString and MFString - Confusion between XML and X3D syntax for SFString [Delete]

◻ **Upload File**

Select File

Maximum size: 5,000 KB   [Browse...] No file selected.   [Upload File]

◻ **Users monitoring this issue**

User List   There are no users monitoring this issue.

          Username [_____]   [Add]

⊟ Notes

There are no notes attached to this issue.

⊟ Add Note

Note

View Status ☐ private

Upload File
Maximum size: 5,000 KB

Browse... No file selected.

Add Note

⊟ Issue History

Date Modified	Username	Field	Change
2015-06-30 07:22	walroy	New Issue	
2016-12-08 02:51	walroy	Relationship added	related to 0001091
2016-12-30 13:12	brutzman	Assigned To	=> brutzman
2016-12-30 13:12	brutzman	Status	new => acknowledged
2017-04-26 07:28	brutzman	Relationship added	related to 0000488

Powered by MantisBT

Copyright © 2000 - 2017 MantisBT Team

Contact administrator for assistance